



## **CALDER HALL SUB-COMMITTEE (CHSC) MEETING**

### **MEETING REFERENCE 06/01**

**DATE:** Wednesday 15 February 2006

**PRESENT:** Cllr David Moore - Chairman, WCSSG  
- Chairman of 1<sup>st</sup> Meeting of CHSC  
Cllr Norman Clarkson - Cumbria County Council  
Mr Frank Duffy - Copeland Borough Council  
Cllr Carni McCarron Holmes - Allerdale Borough Council  
Cllr Tony Johnston - Copeland Borough Council  
Mr John Hetherington - Nuclear Liaison, Cumbria County Council  
Mr Joe Murdock - GMB Union, Sellafield  
Mr Terry Benest - UKAEA  
Mr Martin Grey - NDA  
Mr Paul Brennan - Calder Hall  
Mr Phil Campbell - Calder Hall  
Mrs Dawn Pickup - Secretary to the CHSC

**APOLOGIES:** Mr Ranald Stewart - Ponsonby Parish Council  
Mr David Mason - BNG  
Mr Peter Orr - EA  
Mr Rob Waters - NII  
Mr Alan Ross - Prospect Union, UKAEA  
Mr Terry Bathgate - Cumbria Constabulary, Millom Police  
Mr David Davies - Copeland Borough Council (represented by Mr Frank Duffy)

### **MINUTES**

#### **1 CHAIRMAN'S OPENING REMARKS**

The Chairman of the West Cumbria Sites Stakeholder Group welcomed the members to the 1<sup>st</sup> meeting of the West Cumbria Sites Stakeholder Group – Calder Hall Sub-Committee (WCSSG-CHSC).

It was agreed between the newly elected Chairman, Cllr Clarkson, and Cllr Moore that he continues to chair the 1<sup>st</sup> meeting of the CHSC.

#### **2 RATIFICATION OF PROPOSED TERMS OF REFERENCE**

The draft Terms of Reference for the Calder Hall Sub-Committee had been circulated, for information, to the members prior to the meeting. The Chairman asked the members if they had any comments on the draft document.



Mrs Pickup stated that it mentioned the meetings would be advertised locally in advance of the meeting. This statement is now incorrect as the meeting dates are now included on the Calendar of Events – 2006. This Calendar of Events has been issued to the Stakeholders and general public, through fliers, and it can also be accessed via the WCSSG web site.

With the incorporation of the change noted above the Terms of Reference for the CHSC were agreed.

**ACTION 1: Secretary to make change to Terms of Reference and re-issue to members.**

**3 DEFINE MEMBERSHIP/QUORUM**

The membership was discussed and members agreed that the organisations who had expressed an interest in joining the Calder Hall Sub-Committee, and who had been invited to the first meeting, made up a suitable representation. The membership amounted to 15 people, so the Committee decided that a suitable quorum would be 5. The quorum, however, must include 3 elected members (or representatives).

**4 ELECTION OF CHAIRMAN OF CALDER HALL SUB-COMMITTEE**

Cllr Clarkson was ratified as the Chairman. He would take up this position at the 2<sup>nd</sup> meeting of the CHSC.

**5 ELECTION OF DEPUTY CHAIRMAN OF THE CALDER HALL SUB-COMMITTEE**

Cllr Johnston was ratified as deputy Chairman.

**6 RATIFICATION OF MEETING SECRETARY**

British Nuclear Group has agreed to provide the secretariat for the Calder Hall Sub-Committee. Mrs Pickup has agreed to take on this role and this was ratified by the members. Mrs Pickup would be the first point of contact for the Calder Hall Sub-Committee members.

**7 AGREE DATES OF THE FORTHCOMING CALDER HALL SUB-COMMITTEE**

The members agreed that the CHSC would be held on the third Wednesday in the months of February and August. Should the need arise special meetings could be convened through the meeting Secretary.



## 8 CALDER HALL OVERVIEW PRESENTATION

The Chairman explained that there would be two presentations – one from Mr Grey, NDA and one from Mr Brennan, Calder Hall.

Mr Grey gave a brief presentation on the NDA and also gave out copies of this presentation. This covered the following topics:

- ❖ The NDA
- ❖ Current Status
- ❖ Expectations
- ❖ Next Steps
- ❖ Calder Hall NDA Team
- ❖ Calder Hall Major Areas of Focus
- ❖ Stakeholder Engagement

Mr Grey made a proposal that the Sites End State Consultation should be an item for the next meeting Agenda. Cllr Clarkson agreed with this proposal.

Cllr Moore then went on to say that the WCSSG is currently consulting on the End State of the Sellafield site, this can be accessed via the WCSSG web site. The Committee want to encourage people to come forward with their views on what they think the End State should be.

### **ACTION 2: Secretary to place this item on next Agenda.**

Discussions took place on the Site Lifetime Plan. Mr Grey stated that this was a key requirement of the NDA.

Cllr Hetherington stated these separate plans should be co-ordinated in one document rather than separate documents. Mr Grey confirmed that the plans would be rolled up both by Region and then ultimately on an UK basis. Advice would then be given by the NDA as to where the pinch points are on the site in connection with reduction in resources, need for resources, training or requirement for new resources into the area.

Cllr Moore asked if this would be dealt with as individual sites or Sellafield as a whole. Mr Grey confirmed that all the information is rolled up into a regional perspective, ie Sellafield, Low Level Waste Repository, UKAEA and Calder Hall are all part of Region 3.

Mr Benest asked Mr Grey to clarify a point on NDA organisation. Mr Grey had mentioned in his presentation that he was the lead in a team of 3 under Region 3 looking at Calder Hall and Chapelcross. Mr Grey then went on to say that Chapelcross had recently moved into Region 4, this was a requirement of the Scottish Office. Mr Grey confirmed that for Line Management purposes he is Region 3



aligned. His accountabilities for Chapelcross in Region 4 were effectively under a matrix management set up.

Cllr Moore asked Mr Grey to expand on the Employee Lifetime Partnership Agreement. Mr Grey confirmed that he was not currently involved in this but would relay any information to the members when he had it available.

The Chairman then invited Mr Brennan to address the meeting. Mr Brennan gave a brief resume of his background and explained the current position at Calder Hall. He then went on to say that it was the 50<sup>th</sup> Anniversary of the opening of Calder Hall, this year, and he would like to invite members of the CHSC to make proposals on this matter and also seek views on how this occasion could be marked. He intended to ensure that all members of the CHSC would be involved in deciding on an appropriate means of marking this significant anniversary.

Mr Brennan then handed over to Mr Campbell. Mr Campbell gave a brief resume of his background before covering the following topics:

- ❖ Background to the Environmental Management Plan
- ❖ Calder Hall position
- ❖ Environmental Management Plan

No questions were raised.

**ACTION 3: Secretary to confirm that the Environmental Statement is still on the WCSSG web-site.**

**ACTION 4: Secretary to forward Cllr Clarkson and Mr Murdock a copy of the Environmental Statement -Non-Technical Summary.**

Mr Brennan then continued his overview with the following:

- ❖ Safety
- ❖ Transition from Operational Plant to Decommissioning Plant
- ❖ An Overview of Calder Hall
- ❖ Delagging
- ❖ Cooling Towers
- ❖ Defuelling
- ❖ Removal of Heat Exchangers
- ❖ Ancillary Buildings
- ❖ Oil
- ❖ English Heritage
- ❖ Calder Hall being part of BNG Sellafield or a Northern Bundle



Mr Brennan's presentation gave rise to a number of questions relating to:

a) Cooling Towers

Mr Brennan confirmed that he would inform the CHSC members of the date of demolition as soon as it had been declared.

Cllr Clarkson asked if the date of the cooling tower demolition was dependent on weather conditions. Mr Brennan confirmed that certain weather conditions would be helpful in terms of further dust and noise abatement but that it has been concluded that the safety case for the demolition is not weather-dependent.

Cllr Clarkson enquired about the dust situation and would the general public be informed that this was not contaminated. Mr Brennan confirmed this would be the case.

Mr Brennan stated that the pipes inside the cooling towers were being recycled for pipes for sewer material.

Mr Grey also stated that current plans for the cooling towers is that once the rebar has been stripped out the concrete will be crushed and backfilled into the ponds.

b) Delagging

With regards to the 5,000 tonnes of asbestos that Calder Hall had to dispose of Cllr Clarkson asked if the Health & Safety Executive were kept informed. Mr Brennan confirmed this point.

Mr Benest asked what the disposal route was at Calder Hall for asbestos.

Mr Brennan confirmed that at the moment this was landfill. Ultimately, a number of approaches have been suggested, not least a vitrification process to render the asbestos into a solid crystallised form. This is being pursued at present by BNG. Calder Hall are seeking to reduce the hazard level on the site and removing the material from the heat exchangers is the right thing to do. Calder Hall will pursue any, and every option, available in terms of safe disposal. The asbestos, at present, is stored on the Calder Hall site.

Cllr Johnston stated that Mr Brennan had mentioned the possibility of vitrification of the asbestos. He thought that this was a good idea and suggested that this could have positive commercial implications and could also be applied to the treatment of asbestos from elsewhere in the country.



Mr Brennan replied that the wider application of this treatment technology would be considered as part of any business case.

c) Heat Exchangers

Cllr Clarkson asked if taking the heat exchangers down with fuel still inside the reactors has been done before or was it something new. Mr Brennan confirmed this was new but some elements of heat exchangers had been removed at Berkeley and Trawsfynydd.

Mr Benest asked if the perceived hazard was the lack of stability of the heat exchanger in proximity of the pressure vessel. Mr Brennan confirmed this and added that the likelihood of risk does not change, it is the potential consequence of any accident. However, before any operations are carried out, a full safety case would be developed.

d) English Heritage

Cllr Clarkson asked about potential listing of Calder Hall plant.

Mr Grey stated that an individual had written to English Heritage declaring they wanted to list certain facilities on the Calder Hall site, which comprised of 1 cooling tower, 1 heat exchanger, 1 reactor and 1 turbine hall. English Heritage have then to go through a process to evaluate what they consider appropriate for listing purposes. The NDA had a number of concerns, especially the cooling towers as they are 50 years old, are not in good condition and they need to come down before further structural degradation occurs. NDA have stressed this point to English Heritage and the NDA have engaged a consultant to help make these points. English Heritage had recently agreed to separate out the cooling towers from the other buildings.

Cllr Hetherington asked if it would be helpful to try and develop a more collective view through the Site Stakeholder Group on the merits of listing and whether an appropriate business plan that was viable in commercial terms should be developed.

Mr Grey responded by stating that listing does not itself require visiting rights. Listing is about retaining the buildings in a good condition. It is not a commercial venture, it is about retention and availability. The NDA draft strategy states that they intend to perform a study to see if it is practicable to retain Reactor 1 and Turbine Hall A as an industrial heritage site, this is ongoing at present. This information will be put together to produce a scope of work for the feasibility study and that will form part of the submission to English Heritage. NDA's current view is not to list it but they would like to retain it in some form as an industrial heritage site but only if it is practical and cost effective to do so.



Cllr Hetherington asked about the NDA draft strategy and the achievement of final decommissioning at an early date, ie within 25 years. Was this proposal joined up with other strategies such as waste management?

Mr Grey replied that the figure in the draft NDA strategy of 25 years was brought about through consideration of what else had been done in the world, not just in the UK. The NDA will continue to see what else is available in terms of technology and capability to achieve this end result. This also depends on the decisions on intermediate low level waste, decisions on low level waste repository and the impact on other reactor sites in the UK. There are a number of matters that have to be decided to clear the way to allow this to happen.

Cllr Clarkson stressed that no matter what safety was of paramount importance. This was confirmed by Mr Grey.

Mr Grey confirmed that the NDA fully support the recycling of materials on the Site and the NDA do liaise closely with the Environment Agency on this topic.

Cllr Moore asked Mr Brennan if he was working towards a brown or greenfield site. Mr Brennan confirmed he was working towards a brownfield site.

## 9 ISSUES OF CONCERN FOR LOCAL STAKEHOLDERS

Cllr Clarkson stated that there were no pressing issues and those that had been discussed would be detailed in the Minutes.

## 10 MEMBERS VISIT TO CALDER HALL

It was agreed that a familiarisation visit to Calder Hall should be organised for the CHSC members. Cllr Moore also suggested that this invitation be extended to the WCSSG.

Mrs Pickup agreed to circulate a list of possible dates for the visit to take place and also liaise with the WCSSG secretariat for their membership.

**ACTION 5: Secretary to issue possible dates to CHSC members and liaise with WCSSG Secretariat on the possibility of a joint visit.**

## 11 ANY OTHER BUSINESS

There was no other business raised.

## 12 DATE, TIME AND VENUE OF NEXT MEETING

The date of the next meeting is Wednesday 16 August 2006, starting at 1400 hours at the Ennerdale Country House Hotel, Cleator.



## West Cumbria Sites Stakeholder Group

The meeting concluded at 1545 hours.

### **1 March 2006**

**Chairman:** Cllr David Moore – 1<sup>st</sup> meeting only  
Cllr Norman Clarkson

**Secretary:** Mrs Dawn Pickup

**Telephone:** 019467 73123

**E-mail:** dawn.pickup@britishnucleargroup.com

**Fax:** 019467 21041